
CORPORATE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE, 13.11.14

Present: Councillor Dyfrig Jones (Chair).

Councillors:- Trevor Edwards, Aled Evans, Siân Gwenllian, Annwen Hughes, June Marshall, Dafydd Meurig, Michael Sol Owen, W.Roy Owen, Eirwyn Williams and Gethin Glyn Williams.

Officers present:- Geraint George (Head of Strategic and Improvement Department), Debbie Anne Williams Jones (Members' Manager - Democratic Services) and Eirian Roberts (Member Support and Scrutiny Officer).

Present for item 3 below:-

Councillor Dyfed Edwards, Council Leader

Present for item 4 below:-

Councillor John Wynn Jones, Cabinet Member for the Economy

Present for item 5 below:-

Councillor Peredur Jenkins, Cabinet Member for Resources

Councillor Peter Read, Chair of the Savings Scrutiny Working Group

Dilwyn Williams, Chief Executive

Apologies: Councillors Lesley Day, Elwyn Edwards and Jason Humphreys.

Councillors Annwen Hughes and W. Roy Owen were welcomed to their first meeting of this committee.

1. DECLARATION OF PERSONAL INTEREST

The Chief Executive declared a personal interest in Efficiency Saving Proposal A5 – Nursery Education (under item 7 on the agenda), as his wife worked for *Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin*, and he left the room during the discussion on this proposal.

2. MINUTES

The Chair signed the minutes of the previous meeting of this committee held on 11 September 2014 as a true record.

Referring to items 3 and 4, the Chair noted that the next Preparatory Meeting would consider how to receive information about *Gwynedd Amdani* and Systems Thinking from now on.

3. RURAL AGENDA SCRUTINY INVESTIGATION Cabinet Member: Councillor Dyfed Edwards

(A) Submitted – the report of the Leader highlighting the steps taken by him to date to respond to the recommendations of the Scrutiny Investigation.

(B) Members were given an opportunity to ask questions and offer their observations. During the discussion, the Leader responded to questions / observations regarding:-

- What was possible within existing systems and what needed to be amended in the Strategic Plan.
- Lobbying work in order to seek to influence national policies.
- Hidden poverty and the fact that the national measures only recognised poverty intensity.

RESOLVED to note the progress to date and receive a further report from the Leader in January 2015 on the recommendations which are relevant to the Council's work.

**4. SUSTAINABLE PROCUREMENT SCRUTINY INVESTIGATION
Cabinet Member: Councillor John Wynn Jones**

- (A) Submitted – the report of the Cabinet Member for the Economy in response to specific questions relating to the recommendations.
- (B) Members were given an opportunity to ask further questions and offer their observations. During the discussion, the Cabinet Member for the Economy and the Head of Strategic and Improvement Department responded to questions / observations regarding:-
- Bureaucracy and the risk of increasing staff workload.
 - Measuring success on the highest level.
 - The challenge of establishing key results for the 2014-17 period.
 - How challenging were the objectives?
 - Being more ambitious and procure from neighbouring counties.
 - The aim of creating one system and one team to undertake the work across the Council.
 - The food chain in terms of supplying meat to schools.

RESOLVED to accept the report and consider the matter further at a later date.

5. EFFICIENCY SAVINGS PROPOSALS

- (A) Submitted – the report of the Chair of the Savings Scrutiny Working Group submitting the recommendations of the working group to this scrutiny committee, along with a copy of the Members' Workshop papers, for information. Members were asked to consider and agree on any recommendations to be submitted to the Cabinet for it to make its decision on 16 December.
- (B) Members were given an opportunity to ask questions on the content of the Members' Workshops papers. The Chief Executive responded to questions regarding school balances along with the following savings schemes:-
- HAM4 (More effective running of Leisure Facilities). The Chief Executive explained that it was only the first part of the proposal that had been submitted to date and he agreed to send detailed information to the member.
 - C23 (Restructure Internal Audit).
 - RH2 (Monitoring Flow / Speed (Traffic Unit))
 - C1 (Restructure Revenue)

In response to a further enquiry, the Chief Executive explained that the 197 savings proposals would lead to a loss of 166 jobs, and that there were 34 other schemes to

be added whose implications in relation to job losses were not yet clear. Members called for a detailed analysis at the end of the process of all the jobs lost along with the nature of the redundancies.

(C) The working group's recommendations were considered, with attention given first of all to the proposals which were to be realised in 2015/16 (highlighted in grey in the report). During the discussion:-

- The Chair of the Working Group expressed his wish to add proposals P6 (Decommission a service level agreement with South Gwynedd Women's Aid) and P7 (Decommission a service level agreement with Bangor Women's Aid) to the list of proposals requiring further scrutiny in order to understand the impact on the people of Gwynedd. The Head of Strategic and Improvement Department noted that the Head of Children and Supporting Families Service had reported that there was a risk but that the risk was comparatively low. It was noted that it was only one element of the work of the shelters that was in question and the Council's statutory responsibilities would still be fulfilled. Concern was expressed that implementing these proposals could lead to further costs because it would increase the Council's accountability.
- A5 (Nursery Education). It was noted that members did not agree with the wording "*broader options to parents, providing them with the choice of placing their children in school or in a cylch meithrin*" in the table "Impact on the People of Gwynedd" because it was possible that there would be no *cylchoedd meithrin* in some rural areas of the county. The Chair noted that the purpose of the recommendation was to seek more clarity on this.

RESOLVED to submit the following recommendations to the Cabinet for it to make its decision on 16 December, along with the two additional matters raised by the Chair of the Savings Scrutiny Working Group:-

Ref.	Title of proposal	Recommendation
DaCh4	Reduce the publicity budget of Elector Registration	Recommend that the Corporate Scrutiny Committee scrutinises what the impact of the scheme would be on our capacity to ensure the statutory duty to register electors.
SaG6	Research and Analysis	Working group noted that the proposal should be held back for the time being until such time as the situation with cuts is clear and consider drawing up a business case to keep the unit as it is.
C25	Stop providing the out of hours systems support service	Recommend that the Corporate Scrutiny Committee scrutinises what the impact of the scheme on the capacity of the relevant services would be in maintaining out of hours services should systems fail.
OED	Proposals in the Adults field	Need to ensure a timetable for the proposals and the need to have firm project plans in order to ensure that we would realise the proposals, and that the

Ref.	Title of proposal	Recommendation
		attention of the Corporate Scrutiny Committee should be drawn to that need.
OED13	Adapting providers' contracts	It is recommended that further information be submitted to the Corporate Scrutiny Committee regarding the possible impact of the proposal.
Rh9	Cessation of non-statutory functions – Pest Control Services	<p>It is recommended that the Corporate Scrutiny Committee obtains clarity on the actual impact of the main options and addresses the following questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - If the fee was increased to cover service provision costs, would it still be competitive with the private sector? - What would be the effect of increasing the fee on other Gwynedd Council departments?
Rh11, Rh12 and Rh27	A 10% reduction in Public Protection budgets (3 stages)	It is recommended that the Corporate Scrutiny Committee obtains clarity on the actual impact of the proposals after they have started to be realised.
Rh16	Advertising planning applications in the press	It is recommended that the Corporate Scrutiny Committee obtains better clarity regarding the potential impact the proposal could have on the democratic process.
PB1	Procurement	It is recommended that the Corporate Scrutiny Committee ensures the right balance between saving money and keeping the benefit local.
PB24	A Different Procedure for Replacing Lamps	It is recommended that the Corporate Scrutiny Committee looks at and compares the proposal with the current procedure (bulk change) in order to ensure that we are making the right decision. The bulk change procedure was introduced as a way of saving money in the first place.
A5	Nursery Education	It is recommended that further information be submitted to the Corporate Scrutiny Committee regarding the possible impact of the proposal.

Additional matters

P6	Decommission a service level agreement with South Gwynedd Women's Aid	Ask the Cabinet not to proceed immediately and refer the proposal to the Services Scrutiny Committee for it to scrutinise the impact further, on the understanding that a decision would be needed before 1 April 2015.
P7	Decommission a service level agreement with Bangor Women's Aid	Ask the Cabinet not to proceed immediately and refer the proposal to the Services Scrutiny Committee for it to scrutinise the impact further, on the understanding that a decision would be needed before 1 April 2015.

Proposals to be realised in 2015/16**6. LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN SCRUTINY INVESTIGATION - COLLABORATION**

The committee was asked to confirm the membership of the Scrutiny Investigation Group.

RESOLVED to confirm the following membership for the Scrutiny Investigation Group:-

Chair of this committee, Councillor Dyfrig Jones, along with Councillors Trevor Edwards and Eirwyn Williams.

The meeting commenced at 10.30am and concluded at 12.20pm